
The Supreme Court in the Early Republic:

The Chief Justiceships of
John Jay and Oliver Ellsworth



by William R. Casto

University of South Carolina Press

CONTENTS

Editor's Preface	xi
Preface and Acknowledgments	xv
Repository Symbols	xvii
Short Titles and Abbreviations	xix
Introduction	1
1 Creating the Court	4
The Federal Courts' Subject-Matter Jurisdiction	5
Judicial Appointments	16
Good Behavior and Compensation	18
Judicial Review	19
Nonjudicial Duties	23
Looking to the Future	25
2 The Judiciary Act of 1789	27
Drafting the Judiciary Act	27
Opposition to the Federal Courts	29
The Seeds of a Compromiss	31
Limiting the Supreme Court's Jurisdiction	33
Federal Trial Courts: Admiralty Jurisdiction	38
Shaping the Compromise on Federal Trial Courts	41
The Congress Accepts Ellsworth's Compromise	47
Congressional Instrumentalism	51
3 Selecting the Justices and Initial Operations	54
The First Nominees	56
Assessing Washington's Nomination Criteria	65

4	A National Security Court	71
	The Nootka Sound Crisis	71
	Relations with France and Great Britain	72
	The Neutrality Proclamation	74
	The Treaty of Alliance and the Correspondence of the Justices	75
	Admiralty Jurisdiction I: <i>Glass v. The Sloop Betsy</i>	82
	The Jay Treaty I: Extrajudicial Service	87
	The Jay Treaty II: The Rutledge Fiasco	90
	Oliver Ellsworth and Samuel Chase	95
	The Jay Treaty III: Advisory Opinions	97
	The British Debt Cases	98
	The Power to Tax	101
	Admiralty Jurisdiction II: <i>La Vengeance</i>	105
	<i>La Vengeance</i> : Majority Opinions and Chiefly Leadership	110
	Admiralty Jurisdiction III: Restitution of Prizes	112
	The Jay Treaty IV: Sale of Prizes	115
	Bushrod Washington	117
	The Quasi-War I: The Ellsworth Mission	118
	Alfred Moore	120
	The Quasi-War II: <i>Bas v. Tingy</i>	120
	The Quasi-War III: Chief Justice Ellsworth Resigns	124
5	National Security and Federal Criminal Law	126
	Political Grand Jury Charges	126
	Common-Law Crimes	129
	Enforcing the Law of Nations	130
	Beyond the Law of Nations: The <i>Worrall</i> Case	141
	The Problem of Seditious Libel	147
	Federal Common Law and the <i>Williams</i> Case	152
	The <i>Williams</i> Case and Interstitial Federal Common Law	154
	Common-Law Crimes and Common-Law Thinking	155
	Statutory Crimes: The Whiskey Rebellion	163
	Statutory Crimes: Justice Chase on Circuit	165
6	Nonjudicial Activities	173
	Ex-Officio Duties	174
	The Invalid Pensioners Act	175
	Advisory Opinions	178
	A Pragmatic Approach to Nonjudicial Activities	180

7 The Constitution and State Sovereignty	184
<i>Chisholm v. Georgia</i>	188
The Eleventh Amendment	197
The Scope of the Eleventh Amendment	202
Suits by Foreign States	203
Suits in Admiralty	204
Enforcement of Federal Rights	205
The Federalists and the Eleventh Amendment	211
8 The Court and the Constitution	213
Judicial Review of Federal Actions	214
The Sovereignty of the People	215
Justice Chase's Doubts	220
Interpreting the Constitution	222
Congressional Power to Restrict Jurisdiction	239
9 An Assessment	247
Table of Cases	255
Index	259