

Law and Biotechnology

Cases and Materials

Victoria Sutton

ROBERT H. BEAN PROFESSOR OF LAW
TEXAS TECH UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF LAW

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina

Contents

Table of Cases	xi
Foreword	xiii
Preface	xv
About the Author	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
Chapter One Introduction	3
1.1 The Relationship between Law and Biotechnology	3
1.1.1 Defining Biotechnology	4
1.1.1.1 Monoclonal Antibody Technology	4
1.1.1.2 Cell Culture Technology	5
1.1.1.3 Genetic Engineering Technology	5
1.1.1.4 Biosensor Technology	6
1.1.1.5 Antisense Technology	6
1.1.1.6 DNA Chip Technology	6
1.1.1.7 Tissue Engineering	7
1.1.1.8 Bioprocessing Technology	7
1.1.1.9 Bioinformatics	8
1.1.2 Defining Bioengineering	9
1.1.3 Defining Genomics	9
1.1.4 Defining Proteomics	10
1.1.5 Defining Nanobiotechnology	10
1.2 The History of Biotechnology and Law in Eurasia and the Americas	11
1.3 Introduction to the Scientific Method and Biotechnology	18
1.4 Biotechnology—What New Questions Have Been Raised?	20
<i>Diamond v. Chakrabarty</i>	20
Notes	26
<i>Pioneer Hi-Bred International, Inc. v. J.E.M. Ag Supply</i>	27
Notes	29
Chapter Two Federalism: Distributions of Power to Regulate Biotechnology	31
2.1 Federal Government	31
2.1.1 Executive Branch	31
2.1.1.1 Regulation of Biotechnology	32
2.1.1.1.1 Early Developments in Modern Biotechnology Regulation	32
2.1.1.1.2 Federal Regulations—What Is Regulated?	36
2.1.2 Patents for Biotechnology	41

2.1.3	Food and Drug Administration and the Environmental Protection Agency: Genetically Engineered Foods	42
2.1.3.1	History of Law and Food Regulation	42
2.1.3.2	The Controversy over Genetically Engineered Foods <i>Stauber v. Shalala and Kessler</i>	47 48
	<i>Alliance for Bio-Integrity v. Shalala</i>	59
	Notes	66
2.1.3.3	The Regulation of Genetically Engineered Foods	67
2.1.3.4	Constitutional First Amendment Limitations in State Labeling Regulations <i>International Dairy Foods Association v. Amestoy, Attorney General of the State of Vermont</i>	70 70
	Notes	80
2.1.4	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and Department of Agriculture: Genetically Engineered Plants <i>Foundation on Economic Trends v. Thomas</i>	82 82
	<i>Foundation on Economic Trends v. Lyng</i>	86
	Notes	89
2.1.5	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, National Institutes of Health: Genetically Modified Organisms <i>Foundation on Economic Trends v. Heckler</i>	90 90
	<i>Foundation on Economic Trends v. Block</i>	99
	<i>Foundation on Economic Trends v. Bowen</i>	101
	Notes	106
2.1.6	U.S. Department of Agriculture and BioPharming <i>Center for Food Safety v. Veneman</i>	106 110
	<i>Center for Food Safety v. Johanns</i>	111
2.2	Legislative Branch	121
2.2.1	Legislation and Problems with Biotechnology Notes	121 129
2.2.2	Genetic Preservation	129
2.2.3	Cloning Prohibition	130
2.3	State Governments and Biotechnology Regulation	131
2.3.1	Biotechnology and State Support	131
2.3.2	State Codes	132
Chapter Three	Private Sector Profits and Biotechnology	137
3.1	Introduction	137
3.2	Biotechnology Issues in Fraud	138
3.2.1	Securities Fraud <i>In Re Ribozyme Pharmaceuticals, Inc. Securities Litigation</i>	138 138
	Notes	143
3.2.2	Contract Fraud <i>Rhone-Poulenc Agro S.A. v. Monsanto Company and Dekalb Genetics Corp.</i>	144 144
3.3	Intellectual Property Protection Issues	149
3.3.1	Trade Secrets as an Approach to Protecting Corporate Knowledge <i>Microbix Biosystems, Inc. v. Biowhittaker, Inc.</i>	149 150

	<i>North Carolina Farm Partnership v. Pig Improvement Company, Inc.</i>	152
3.3.2	Patenting as an Approach to Protecting Corporate Knowledge in Corporate Competitive Research <i>Scripps Clinic and Research Foundation v. Genentech, Inc.</i>	153 154
3.4	Bioprospecting—Private Sector Agreements with the Government <i>Edmonds Institute v. Babbitt, Secretary of Interior</i>	156 156
3.5	Patents in Biotechnology	164
3.5.1	Biotechnology Patents Applications Requirements	167
3.5.1.1	The Utility Requirement	168
3.5.1.2	The Written Description Requirement. 35 U.S.C. § 112	168
3.5.1.3	The Enabling Requirement. 35 U.S.C. § 112 <i>In Re Thomas Deuel</i>	169 169
	<i>Amgen, Inc. v. Hoechst</i>	173
3.5.2	Unique Problems in Patenting Biotechnology <i>Monsanto Canada, Inc. v. Schmeiser</i> <i>Schmeiser v. Monsanto Canada Inc.</i>	178 178 191
3.6	New Professions and Legal Issues	208
3.6.1	Bioengineers	208
3.6.2	Genetic Counselors	209
	Notes	211
Chapter Four	Human Health, Medical Care, Medical Information Disclosure in Biotechnology	215
4.1	Disclosure of Medical Information and Privacy	215
4.1.1	Right to Privacy	215
4.1.2	Limited Right to Privacy	216
4.1.2.1	Limited Right to Privacy in the Military <i>Mayfield v. Dalton</i>	216 216
4.1.2.2	Adoption Right to Know <i>In the Matter of Sandra L.G. v. Bouchey</i>	218 218
4.1.3	Use of Genetic Information	220
4.2	Informed Consent, High Risk Treatments and Research Notes	224 229
4.3	Insurance and Predisposition to Disease <i>Katskee v. Blue Cross/Blue Shield of Nebraska</i>	229 229
	Notes	230
Chapter Five	International Law and Biotechnology	231
5.1	International Environment and Biotechnology Issues	231
5.2	Introduction to Biodiversity and the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)	231
5.2.1	The Convention on Biological Diversity	232
5.2.1.1	History and Background of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD)	232
5.2.1.2	Structure of the Convention on Biological Diversity	233
5.2.1.2.1	Article 8(j)	235
5.2.1.2.2	Article 15. Access to Genetic Resources	236
5.3	Bioprospecting and International Biopiracy	237

5.3.1	International Approaches to Bioprospecting	238
5.3.1.1	Convention on Biological Diversity	238
5.3.1.2	FAO International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture	238
5.3.1.3	WTO Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights	238
5.3.1.4	International Convention for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants	239
5.3.1.5	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora	240
5.3.1.6	The Antarctic Treaty	240
5.3.1.7	Universal Declaration of Human Rights	240
5.3.1.8	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	240
5.3.2	Regional Agreements	240
5.4	International Codes of Conduct for Bioprospecting	241
5.4.1	The Micro-Organisms Sustainable Use and Access Regulation International Code of Conduct (MOSAICC)	241
5.4.2	Bonn Guidelines on Access to Genetic Resources and Fair and Equitable Sharing of the Benefits Arising Out of Their Utilization	244
5.5	International Intellectual Property and Biotechnology	246
5.5.1	Patent Protection in the United States	246
5.5.2	Patent Protection in Other Countries	246
5.5.3	International Patenting	247
5.6	International Trade and Biotechnology	247
5.6.1	Exporting Biotechnologies	247
5.6.2	The Cartagena Biosafety Protocol	247
5.7	International Security	248
5.8	International Human Rights and Biotechnology	248
5.8.1	United Nations Treaty on Indigenous Peoples and Human Rights	248
5.9	Human DNA	249
Chapter Six	Bioethics, Religion and Biotechnology	253
6.1	Law, Biotechnology and Religion: Humans' Relationship with Biotechnology and Religion	253
6.1.1	Free Exercise Clause Challenge to Biotechnology	253
	<i>Alliance for Bio-Integrity v. Shalala</i>	253
	Notes	256
6.1.2	Religious Views on Biotechnology	256
	6.1.2.1 Stem Cell Research and Religion	256
	6.1.2.2 Cloning and Religion	258
6.2	Ethics and Biotechnology	260
	6.2.1 Public Sector Considers Ethics and Biotechnology	260
	6.2.2 The Private Sector Considers Ethics and Biotechnology	262
6.3	Family Relations: Legal v. Biological	262
	<i>Stitham v. Henderson</i>	262
6.4	Reproductive Technologies	265

<i>Margaret S. v. Edwards</i>	265
<i>Lifchez v. Hartigan</i>	266
Notes	269
6.4.1 Post Mortem Sperm Collection	270
6.4.2 Ectogenesis	272
6.5 Eugenics	273
6.6 Stem Cell Research	274
6.6.1 The Controversy with Stem Cell Research	274
6.6.2 What Are These Embryonic Stem Cells?	276
6.6.3 Sources of Embryonic Stem Cells	276
6.6.4 State Regulation of Stem Cell Research	276
Notes	277
6.7 Cloning	277
6.8 The Ethics of Contamination of Indigenous Crops with Genetically Modified Crops	278
Chapter Seven Criminal Law and Biotechnology	283
7.1 Existing Federal Crimes Applicable to New Problems in Biotechnology	283
7.1.1 Mail Fraud	283
<i>United States v. Greene</i>	283
7.1.2 The Great Train Robbery in Biotechnology	284
7.2 The Use of DNA in Criminal Law	290
<i>Spencer v. Murray</i>	290
7.3 New Federal Statutes for New Problems in Biotechnology	292
<i>United States v. Wise</i>	293
<i>United States v. Slaughter</i>	296
Notes	300
7.4 Biotechnology and the Changing Concept of “Expectation of Privacy”	300
<i>Illinois v. Wealer</i>	301
<i>People v. King</i>	303
Notes	306
7.5 Human Behavioral Genetics and Criminal Predisposition	306
<i>Buck v. Bell</i>	310
<i>New York v. Weinstein</i>	311
Notes	314
7.6 Criminal Law Attorneys and Obligation to Understand Science	314
7.6.1 The Genetics Defense	314
7.6.2 Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	315
<i>Mobley v. Head</i>	315
<i>Ohio v. Lane</i>	318
7.7 Biopiracy	319
Chapter Eight Scientific Evidence and Biotechnology	321
8.1 Introduction	321
8.2 The Legal Foundation of Scientific Evidence	321
<i>Frye v. United States</i>	322
<i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i>	324
<i>General Electric Company v. Joiner</i>	332

	<i>Kumho Tire Company v. Carmichael</i>	338
8.3	Mitochondrial DNA	346
	<i>United States v. Beverly</i>	347
8.4	Historical Forensics and the Use of DNA Evidence	353
	8.4.1 Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings	353
	8.4.2 Abraham Lincoln and Marfan Syndrome?	353
	Notes	354
Chapter Nine Biotechnology and Property Law		355
9.1	Introduction	355
9.2	Ownership Problems	355
	<i>Moore v. Regents of University of California</i>	355
	<i>Miles, Inc. v. Scripps Clinic and Research Foundation</i>	362
9.3	Special Property Protection Problems of Biotechnology:	
	Patent Ownership Problems	368
	<i>In Re Thomas Deuel</i>	369
	<i>Animal Legal Defense Fund v. Quigg</i>	375
9.4	Ownership of Human Organs	378
9.5	Ownership of Human Fertilized Eggs	389
	<i>Kass v. Kass</i>	389
9.6	Umbilical Cord Blood Banks	391
	Notes	393
Chapter Ten Biotechnology and Tort Law		395
10.1	Intentional Torts	395
	<i>Moore v. Regents of University of California</i>	396
	<i>In Re Starlink Corn Products Liability Litigation</i>	402
10.2	Unintentional Torts	409
	10.2.1 Wrongful Birth/Wrongful Life: Medical Malpractice	410
	<i>Shroeder v. Perkel</i>	410
	<i>Reed v. Campagnolo</i>	415
	10.2.2 Products Liability	427
	<i>In Re Starlink Corn Products Liability Litigation</i>	431
	10.2.3 Strict Liability Legislation	435
Chapter Eleven The Future of Biotechnology and Law		437
Appendix 1 Primer on Cell Biology		447
Appendix 2 Primer on Molecular Biology		451
Appendix 3 Primer on DNA		455
Appendix 4 Glossary		461
Index		473